

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC197/17-18

(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(31)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 66th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Wednesday, 19 July 2017, at 4:39 pm

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kin-por, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kiwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP
Hon HO Kai-ming
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon SHIU Ka-fai
Hon SHIU Ka-chun
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN
Hon CHAN Chun-ying
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP
Hon HUI Chi-fung
Hon LUK Chung-hung
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon KWONG Chun-yu
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho

Members absent:

Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, GBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP

Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan
Hon Tanya CHAN

Public officers attending:

Ms Alice LAU Yim, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Jenny CHOI Mui-fun	Acting Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 1
Mr Raistlin LAU, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 3
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Kevin YEUNG Yun-hung, JP	Secretary for Education
Mr Brian LO Sai-hung, JP	Acting Permanent Secretary for Education
Mrs Angelina CHEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Education (6)
Mr Godwin LAI Kam-tong	Principal Assistant Secretary for Education (Special Education), Education Bureau

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)5
Ms Ada LAU	Senior Council Secretary (1)7
Mr Raymond SZETO	Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Michelle NIEN	Legislative Assistant (1)5

Item No. 1 — FCR(2017-18)24
Head 156 — GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT:
EDUCATION BUREAU
Subhead 000 — Operational expenses

The Finance Committee ("FC") continued with the discussion on item FCR(2017-18)24.

Motions proposed by members under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure

2. The Chairman said that so far, 21 motions proposed by members under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure ("FCP") ("37A motions") had been received. He called on members who intended to move additional 37A motions to do so as early as possible.

3. The Chairman put to vote the question that Mr CHU Hoi-dick's motion numbered [0002](#) be proceeded forthwith by FC. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman declared that the question put was carried.

4. As FC agreed to proceed with motion numbered 0002 forthwith, the Chairman then proposed the question on the motion and directed that Mr CHU should speak first, to be followed by other members. Each member might speak once on the motion for not more than three minutes.

5. Mr CHU Hoi-dick called on members to support motion numbered 0002.

6. There being no other member requesting to speak, the Chairman put the motion to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

7. The Chairman put to vote the question that Mr CHU Hoi-dick's motion numbered [0004](#) be proceeded forthwith by FC. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman declared that the question put was carried.

8. While the division bell was ringing, Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung asked about the way in which the Administration responded to 37A motions that were agreed to. The Chairman said that he would request the Administration to expeditiously provide written responses to such motions.

9. Secretary for Education replied that in accordance with the established arrangement, the Administration would provide written responses after studying the relevant motions in detail.

10. As FC agreed to proceed with motion numbered 0004 forthwith, the Chairman then proposed the question on the motion and directed that Mr CHU should speak first, to be followed by other members. Each member might speak once on the motion for not more than three minutes.

11. Mr CHU Hoi-dick called on members to support motion numbered 0004.

Motion moved under paragraph 47 of the Finance Committee Procedure

12. At 4:57 pm, Dr Helena WONG moved a motion under FCP 47 that in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of any motions or questions under the same agenda item, FC should proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell had been rung for one minute. The Chairman then proposed the question on Dr WONG's motion.

13. Dr Helena WONG said that it was the last FC meeting in the current legislative session, but a dozen or so 37A motions had yet to be dealt with. As she hoped that item FCR(2017-18)24 could be voted on by FC at this meeting, she moved the motion to shorten the duration of the division bell to one minute in order to save meeting time.

14. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen spoke against the motion. He considered that as members could freely decide whether to claim divisions on the 37A motions, it was thus unnecessary to shorten the duration of the division bell to one minute.

15. Ms Alice MAK said that it should be put on record so that members of the non-establishment camp might, at future FC meetings, reflect on the rationale behind the present motion. Mr CHAN Han-pan criticized members of the non-establishment camp for filibustering which had so far prevented FC from approving any item at today's meetings.

16. Mr CHU Hoi-dick said that given the court's ruling that a number of members of the democratic camp had been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council ("LegCo"), FC could not function properly. He considered that the responsibility should rest with the Administration and the pro-establishment camp.

17. The Chairman called on members to expeditiously deliberate the items on the agenda.

18. There being no other member requesting to speak, the Chairman put the motion to vote forthwith. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried. The votes of individual members were set out in the **Annex**.

Continued handling of the 37A motions proposed by members

19. There being no other member requesting to speak on Mr CHU Hoi-dick's motion numbered 0004, the Chairman put the motion to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for one minute. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

20. Dr Helena WONG withdrew motion numbered 0013. Dr KWOK Ka-ki withdrew motion numbered 0017.

21. The Chairman put to vote, one by one, the questions that the motions moved by members be proceeded forthwith by FC. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division on each of the motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute on each occasion. For motions to be proceeded forthwith as decided by FC, the Chairman proposed the questions thereon immediately after FC had agreed to proceed with such motions forthwith. He directed that movers of the motions should speak first, to be followed by other members. On each occasion, each member might speak once for not more than three minutes. After members had spoken on the motions, at the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division on each such motion and the division bell was rung for one minute on each occasion. The voting results on the questions put on whether the motions proposed by members should be proceeded forthwith, as well as the voting results on the motions were set out as follows:

Members proposing the motions	Serial No. of motions	Motions be proceeded forthwith or not	Voting results on the motions
Mr CHU Hoi-dick	0023, 0026	Yes	Carried
Mr CHU Hoi-dick	0025	No	-
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung	0007, 0010, 0012	Yes	Carried
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung	0008, 0009, 0011	No	-
Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan	0014	Yes	Carried
Dr KWOK Ka-ki	0015, 0016	Yes	Carried
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	0018, 0019	Yes	Carried
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	0020, 0021, 0022	No	-

Speaking on motion numbered 0026

22. Mr CHU Hoi-dick called on members to support motion numbered 0026.

23. Regarding the request in motion numbered 0026 that the Administration should first introduce a more stringent monitoring system on the fees charged by self-financing institutions before disbursement of subsidies, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen sought Mr CHU Hoi-dick's clarification that FC could still approve the funding to the Administration in the current year even if the motion was passed. Mr CHU concurred with Mr CHAN's interpretation.

24. Mr CHAN Han-pan criticized that if members had any views on the proposal or education policies, they should raise them in meetings of the Panel on Education, instead of moving motions in FC to stall its passage.

25. Mr Tommy CHEUNG opined and the Chairman agreed that if FC agreed to proceed with certain 37A motions, they should be given time to discuss the same.

Speaking on motion numbered 0007

26. Dr Fernando CHEUNG called on members to support motion numbered 0007.

27. Ms Starry LEE queried the accuracy of the motion's wording as the minimum entrance requirement for undergraduate programmes should be the attainment of "3322" in the Hong Kong Diploma of Secondary Education Examination ("HKDSE"), instead of "33222" as in the motion. In response, Dr Fernando CHEUNG and Dr Helena WONG pointed out that the first four numerals in "33222" referred to the minimum HKDSE results of the four core subjects, while the last numeral referred to the minimum HKDSE result of the elective subject. Thus, "33222" was indeed the minimum entrance requirement for undergraduate programmes.

Speaking on motion numbered 0010

28. Dr Fernando CHEUNG called on members to support motion numbered 0010.

Speaking on motion numbered 0012

29. Dr Fernando CHEUNG called on members to support motion numbered 0012.

Speaking on motion numbered 0014

30. Dr Helena WONG called on members to support motion numbered 0014.

Speaking on motion numbered 0015

31. Dr KWOK Ka-ki called on members to support motion numbered 0015.

Speaking on motion numbered 0016

32. Dr KWOK Ka-ki called on members to support motion numbered 0016.

33. Mr CHAN Han-pan criticized that even if the motion was worth supporting, he could only vote in abstention because there was not enough time for discussion. He reiterated that if members had any views on the proposal or education policies, they should raise them in meetings of the Panel on Education, instead of moving motions in FC to stall the item's passage. He called on members to withdraw those 37A motions which had yet to be voted on.

Speaking on motion numbered 0018

34. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen called on members to support motion numbered 0018. He said that the motion only requested the Administration to expeditiously study the extension of the scope of the non-means-tested subsidy scheme to cover recognized overseas universities, which was a relatively easy task on the Administration's part.

35. Mr CHAN Han-pan reiterated that even if the motion was worth supporting, it should be discussed at the Panel on Education. He again called on members to withdraw those 37A motions which had yet to be voted on.

36. Speaking in reply and responding to Mr CHAN Han-pan's criticism, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen pointed out that he had already expressed the relevant views at meetings of the Panel on Education. Yet they were not discussed thoroughly due to time constraint.

37. Mr Martin LIAO and Mr CHAN Chun-ying respectively declared that their children were studying in overseas universities.

Speaking on motion numbered 0019

38. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen said that the request in his motion numbered 0019 was relatively moderate and rallied for members' support.

39. Ms Starry LEE said that even if the motion was worth supporting, she could either vote in abstention or refrain from voting because there was not sufficient time to study the contents of the motion or discuss it thoroughly. She also called on members to withdraw those 37A motions which had yet to be voted on, so that FC could expeditiously proceed to other agenda items. Mr James TO criticized Ms LEE for being not familiar with education matters.

Speaking on motion numbered 0021

40. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen said that the contents of the present motion had already been incorporated in the motions that were passed by FC earlier (such as motion numbered 0002). If the Administration was willing to give a positive response to the motions already passed by FC, he would consider withdrawing motion numbered 0021. The Chairman advised that no procedure was available for the Administration to give immediate responses to motions.

Voting on item FCR(2017-18)24

41. At 6:03 pm, there being no further question from members, the Chairman put the item to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for one minute. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr James TO Kun-sun	Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him
Mr Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan	Prof Joseph LEE Kok-long
Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung	Ms Starry LEE Wai-king
Mr CHAN Hak-kan	Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Mr WONG Kwok-kin	Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin	Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr MA Fung-kwok
Mr Charles Peter MOK	Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr Kenneth LEUNG	Ms Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr KWOK Wai-keung	Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung
Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan	Mr IP Kin-yuen
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong	Mr POON Siu-ping
Dr CHIANG Lai-wan	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan	Mr Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Mr Jimmy NG Wing-ka	Mr HO Kai-ming
Mr LAM Cheuk-ting	Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Mr SHIU Ka-fai	Mr SHIU Ka-chun
Mr Wilson OR Chong-shing	Dr Pierre CHAN
Mr CHAN Chun-ying	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan
Mr HUI Chi-fung	Mr LUK Chung-hung
Mr LAU Kwok-fan	Mr Kenneth LAU Ip-keung
Mr KWONG Chun-yu	
(43 members)	

Against:

Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	Mr CHU Hoi-dick
Dr CHENG Chung-tai	
(3 members)	

Abstained:

Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung	Ms Claudia MO
Dr KWOK Ka-ki	Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Mr Alvin YEUNG	Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho
(6 members)	

42. The Chairman declared that the item was approved by FC.

Order in Committee

43. At 6:04 pm, Mr HUI Chi-fung and Mr CHU Hoi-dick moved forward to the Chairman's podium while holding a banner and chanting slogans. Ms Claudia MO and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen also left their seats and moved forward to the Chairman's podium while speaking loudly.

44. The Chairman issued warnings to those four members, demanding that they stopped speaking and returned to their seats. As his repeated warnings were in vain, the Chairman ruled that the conduct of the four members was grossly disorderly, and ordered them to withdraw from FC for the remainder of the meeting. The Chairman directed Secretariat staff to execute his orders.

45. At 6:06 pm, the Chairman declared the meeting be suspended as the four members had ignored his orders and continued to speak loudly.

46. The meeting resumed at 6:15 pm. As the order of the meeting could not be restored, the Chairman declared the meeting be suspended and then resumed at 6:25 pm in the Chamber. He also declared that the meeting be extended for 15 minutes to end at 6:50 pm.

47. The meeting resumed at 6:25 pm in the Chamber.

**Item No. 2 — FCR(2017-18)22
RECOMMENDATION OF THE ESTABLISHMENT
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 14 JUNE 2017**

EC(2017-18)2

**Head 158 — GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT :
TRANSPORT AND HOUSING BUREAU
(TRANSPORT BRANCH)**

Subhead 000 — Operational expenses

48. The Chairman advised that this item sought FC's approval of the recommendation of the Establishment Subcommittee made at its meeting held on 14 June 2017, i.e. the recommendation in EC(2017-18)2. No request for separate voting on the recommendation at the FC meeting was made by members.

49. Dr Fernando CHEUNG requested to speak on the item. Given the shortage of meeting time, the Chairman directed that each member might speak for not more than one minute.

50. Dr Fernando CHEUNG and Mr KWONG Chun-yu strongly criticized the Government for instituting legal proceedings in the hope of overturning the results of LegCo elections. They considered that as all urgent funding proposals had already been dealt with, FC should no longer continue with the scrutiny of other non-urgent items. Mr James TO called on the Administration to withdraw the items on the agenda and resubmit them after the political problems arising from the disqualification of LegCo Members had been settled during the summer recess.

51. At 6:29 pm, the Chairman put the item to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him	Mr Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan
Prof Joseph LEE Kok-long	Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king	Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun	Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun	Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr MA Fung-kwok
Mr Charles Peter MOK	Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr Kenneth LEUNG	Ms Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Dr KWOK Ka-ki	Mr KWOK Wai-keung
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung	Mr IP Kin-yuen
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong	Mr POON Siu-ping
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	Mr Alvin YEUNG
Mr HO Kai-ming	Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Mr SHIU Ka-fai	Mr Wilson OR Chong-shing
Dr Pierre CHAN	Mr CHAN Chun-ying
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan	Mr LAU Kwok-fan
Mr Kenneth LAU Ip-keung	Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho
(34 members)	

Against:

Mr SHIU Ka-chun
(1 member)

Abstained:

Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung
(1 member)

52. The Chairman declared that the item was approved by FC.

Item No. 3 — FCR(2017-18)33

**RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PUBLIC WORKS
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 10 JUNE AND 4 JULY 2017**

53. The Chairman advised that this item sought FC's approval of the recommendations of the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") made at its meetings held on 10 June and 4 July 2017, i.e. the recommendations in PWSC(2017-18)9, PWSC(2017-18)6, PWSC(2017-18)7 and PWSC(2016-17)46. Dr Helena WONG had already withdrawn her earlier request for separate voting. Regarding the other three recommendations made by PWSC, no request for separate voting on the recommendations at the FC meeting was made by members.

54. The Chairman advised that he had received a letter from Dr Fernando CHEUNG, requesting the attendance of public officers to answer questions from members, as well as separate voting on the item. Dr CHEUNG also claimed that the agenda was not issued to members in a timely manner. In response, the Chairman pointed out that the agenda for today's meetings had already been issued to members as early as on 14 July 2017, and members should have sufficient time to request separate voting on the item and the attendance of public officers. While he ruled against Dr CHEUNG's request for the attendance of public officers, he would allow separate voting on the item.

PWSC(2017-18)9

Head 703 — BUILDINGS

Health — Hospitals

**86MM — Extension of Operating Theatre Block for Tuen Mun
Hospital**

87MM — New Acute Hospital at Kai Tak Development Area

75MM — Redevelopment of Prince of Wales Hospital, phase 2 (stage 1)

55. The Chairman advised that the first item set out in item FCR(2017-18)33 was PWSC(2017-18)9, i.e. funding applications in relation to the expansion and redevelopment of three hospitals (namely, the extension of the operating theatre block for Tuen Mun Hospital, the construction of a new acute hospital at Kai Tak Development Area and the redevelopment of Prince of Wales Hospital, phase 2 (stage 1)).

56. Ms Alice MAK and Mr CHAN Han-pan expressed support for the item. Originally, they hoped that PWSC(2017-18)9 (namely, the extension of the operating theatre block for Tuen Mun Hospital, the construction of a new acute hospital at Kai Tak Development Area and the redevelopment of Prince of Wales Hospital, phase 2) could be discussed by FC. However, much time had been wasted due to other members' filibustering, and the meeting had very little time left. Hence, they could only support the early passage of the item in the current legislative session.

57. Dr Fernando CHEUNG spoke in rebuttal, pointing out that FC still had time to discuss the item.

58. At 6:37 pm, the Chairman put the item to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him	Mr Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan
Prof Joseph LEE Kok-long	Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king	Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun	Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun	Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr WU Chi-wai	Mr YIU Si-wing
Mr MA Fung-kwok	Mr Charles Peter MOK
Mr CHAN Han-pan	Mr Kenneth LEUNG
Ms Alice MAK Mei-kuen	Dr KWOK Ka-ki
Mr KWOK Wai-keung	Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung
Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan	Mr IP Kin-yuen
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong	Mr POON Siu-ping
Mr Dr LO Wai-kwok	Mr Alvin YEUNG
Mr Andrew WAN Siu-kin	Mr HO Kai-ming
Mr LAM Cheuk-ting	Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Mr SHIU Ka-fai	Mr Wilson OR Chong-shing
Dr Pierre CHAN	Mr CHAN Chun-ying
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan	Mr LAU Kwok-fan
Mr Kenneth LAU Ip-keung	Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho
(38 members)	

Abstained:

Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung
(1 member)

59. The Chairman declared that the item was approved by FC.

60. At 6:43 pm, Dr Helena WONG moved a motion under FCP 47 that in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of any motions or questions under the same agenda item, FC should proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell had been rung for one minute. The Chairman then proposed the question on Dr WONG's motion.

61. Dr Helena WONG called on members to support the motion.

62. At 6:44 pm, there being no other member requesting to speak, the Chairman put the motion to vote. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

PWSC(2017-18)6

Head 704 — DRAINAGE

Environmental Protection — Sewerage and sewage treatment

380DS — Construction of dry weather flow interceptor at Cherry Street box culvert

389DS — Upgrading of West Kowloon and Tsuen Wan sewerage

393DS — Rehabilitation of trunk sewers in Kowloon, Sha Tin and Sai Kung

394DS — Upgrading of Kwun Tong preliminary treatment works

413DS — Enhancement works for Kwun Tong sewage pumping station

63. At 6:44 pm, the Chairman declared that PWSC(2017-18)6 as set out in item FCR(2017-18)33 be put to vote.

64. Dr Fernando CHEUNG raised a point of order and requested to move a motion under FCP 39 that further proceedings of the Committee be adjourned. In response, the Chairman pointed out that under FCP 39, a relevant motion could only be moved by a member when speaking on a proposal.

65. The Chairman pointed out that the present item was a livelihood proposal that was not controversial at all. He called on members to seriously consider whether a motion to adjourn further proceedings of FC should be proposed to obstruct the passage of the item. Mr Alvin YEUNG expressed doubt on the Chairman's statement, pointing out that it was members' right to move motions, and members themselves would consider the political responsibility to be borne.

66. The Chairman advised that considering the progress of the meeting so far, he decided not to allow members to speak on the item. Dr Fernando CHEUNG questioned the Chairman's decision.

67. The Chairman responded that regarding the funding proposals recommended by the two subcommittees for which no request for separate voting had been made by members before the relevant FC meetings, and no public officer had attended for discussion, the Chairman would put them to vote directly without any discussion in accordance with the practice of FC. He considered that the arrangement he adopted previously to allow members to speak on those proposals was too lenient. He thus decided that members should not be allowed to speak on the present item.

68. Mr SHIU Ka-chun stood up in his seat and spoke loudly without the Chairman's permission, requesting to move a motion that further proceedings of FC be then adjourned. The Chairman reiterated that it was out of order for Mr SHIU to move a motion that further proceedings of FC be then adjourned. He thus rejected the request.

69. At 6:47 pm, the Chairman put the item to vote again. No member indicated an intention to claim a division. The Chairman declared that the item was approved by FC.

PWSC(2016-17)46

Head 703 — BUILDINGS

Government Offices — Intra-government services

123KA — Conversion of the former French Mission Building for accommodation use by law-related organizations and related purposes

70. At 6:47 pm, the Chairman put to vote PWSC(2016-17)46 as set out in item FCR(2017-18)33. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for one minute. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him	Mr Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan
Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung	Ms Starry LEE Wai-king
Mr CHAN Hak-kan	Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Mr WONG Kwok-kin	Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr MA Fung-kwok
Mr CHAN Han-pan	Ms Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr KWOK Wai-keung	Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung

Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong	Mr POON Siu-ping
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	Mr HO Kai-ming
Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding	Mr SHIU Ka-fai
Mr Wilson OR Chong-shing	Mr CHAN Chun-ying
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan	Mr LAU Kwok-fan
Mr Kenneth LAU Ip-keung	
(25 members)	

Abstained:

Dr Pierre CHAN
(1 member)

71. The Chairman declared that the item was approved by FC.

PWSC(2017-18)7

Head 709 — WATERWORKS

Water Supplies — Fresh water supplies

356WF — Upgrading of Tung Chung fresh water supply system

363WF — Upgrading of disinfection facilities in water treatment works

357WF — Design and construction for first stage of desalination plant at Tseung Kwan O

72. At 6:49 pm, the Chairman put to vote PWSC(2017-18)7 as set out in item FCR(2017-18)33. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for one minute.

73. At 6:50 pm, the Chairman advised that the item could not be put to vote as it was time for the meeting to end.

74. At 6:50 pm, the Chairman declared the meeting closed.

75. The meeting ended at 6:50 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat

15 March 2018

點名表決 DIVISION: 4
日期 DATE: 19/07/2017
時間 TIME: 05:06:58 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 動議其後就相同議程項目下任何議案或待議議題進行點名表決時，委員會須在點名表決鐘聲響起一分鐘後進行點名表決
Motion that in the event of further divisions being claimed of any motions or questions under the same agenda item, the Committee do proceed such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute

動議人 MOVED BY:

出席 Present : 41
投票 Vote : 39
贊成 Yes : 33
反對 No : 6
棄權 Abstain : 0
結果 Result : 通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	出席	PRESENT	黃碧雲	Dr Helena WONG	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	葉建源	IP Kin-yuen	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	葛珮帆	Dr Elizabeth QUAT		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	出席	PRESENT	廖長江	Martin LIAO	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	潘兆平	POON Siu-ping	贊成	YES
李國麟	Prof Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	蔣麗芸	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES	盧偉國	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong			鍾國斌	CHUNG Kwok-pan	贊成	YES
李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES	楊岳橋	Alvin YEUNG	贊成	YES
陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan			尹兆堅	Andrew WAN	贊成	YES
梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES	朱凱迪	CHU Hoi-dick	反對	NO
黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin			吳永嘉	Jimmy NG		
葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP			何君堯	Dr Junius HO		
謝偉俊	Paul TSE			何啟明	HO Kai-ming		
毛孟靜	Claudia MO	贊成	YES	林卓廷	LAM Cheuk-ting	贊成	YES
田北辰	Michael TIEN			周浩鼎	Holden CHOW	贊成	YES
何俊賢	Steven HO	贊成	YES	邵家輝	SHIU Ka-fai	贊成	YES
易志明	Frankie YICK			邵家臻	SHIU Ka-chun	反對	NO
胡志偉	WU Chi-wai	贊成	YES	柯創盛	Wilson OR	贊成	YES
姚思榮	YIU Si-wing	贊成	YES	容海恩	YUNG Hoi-yan		
馬逢國	MA Fung-kwok			陳沛然	Dr Pierre CHAN	贊成	YES
莫乃光	Charles Peter MOK	贊成	YES	陳振英	CHAN Chun-ying		
陳志全	CHAN Chi-chuen	反對	NO	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN		
陳恒鏞	CHAN Han-pan	贊成	YES	張國鈞	CHEUNG Kwok-kwan	贊成	YES
梁志祥	LEUNG Che-cheung			許智峯	HUI Chi-fung	贊成	YES
梁繼昌	Kenneth LEUNG	贊成	YES	陸頌雄	LUK Chung-hung		
麥美娟	Alice MAK			劉國勳	LAU Kwok-fan	贊成	YES
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES	劉業強	Kenneth LAU		
郭偉強	KWOK Wai-keung			鄭松泰	Dr CHENG Chung-tai	反對	NO
郭榮鏗	Dennis KWOK			鄭俊宇	KWONG Chun-yu	贊成	YES
張華峰	Christopher CHEUNG			譚文豪	Jeremy TAM	贊成	YES
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO				

秘書 CLERK

