

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC119/18-19
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(11)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 12th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Friday, 5 January 2018, at 3:15 pm

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kin-por, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, GBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yea, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG

Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon HO Kai-ming
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon SHIU Ka-fai
Hon SHIU Ka-chun
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP
Hon LUK Chung-hung
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon KWONG Chun-yu
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho

Members absent:

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kiwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP
Hon CHAN Chun-ying
Hon HUI Chi-fung

Public officers attending:

Ms Alice LAU Yim, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Kinnie WONG Kit-yee	Acting Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 1
Mr Mike CHENG Wai-man	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mrs Sorais LEE KWAN Siu-kuen, JP	Project Manager, Home Affairs Bureau
Mrs Angelina CHEUNG FUNG	Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (2)
Mr Eric CHENG Siu-fun	Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (West Kowloon Cultural District)
Ms Alice PANG, JP	Project Manager (South), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr Ringo MOK Wing-cheong	Deputy Project Manager (South), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr Duncan PESCOD, GBS, JP	Chief Executive Officer, West Kowloon Cultural District Authority
Mr NG Ying-chuen	Head (Technical Services), West Kowloon Cultural District Authority
Dr CHUI Tak-yi, JP	Under Secretary for Food and Health
Miss Diane WONG Shuk-han	Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food)2
Mr David WONG Fuk-loi, JP	Deputy Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Administration and Development)
Mr LAM Wing-hong	Assistant Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Operations)2
Ms Kitty CHOI Kit-yu, JP	Director of Administration

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)5
Ms Ada LAU	Senior Council Secretary (1)7

Mr Raymond SZETO	Council Secretary (1)5
Miss Queenie LAM	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)2
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Michelle NIEN	Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

The Chairman reminded members of the requirements under Rule 83A and 84 of the Rules of Procedure.

Item No. 1 — FCR(2017-18)42
RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 4 JULY 2017

PWSC(2017-18)12
HEAD 707 — NEW TOWNS AND URBAN AREA DEVELOPMENT
Civil Engineering — Land Development
763CL — Integrated Basement for West Kowloon Cultural
District

2. The Finance Committee ("FC") continued with the deliberation on item FCR(2017-18)42. The Chairman advised that this item sought the approval of FC for the recommendation made by the Public Works Subcommittee at its meeting held on 4 July 2017, i.e. the recommendation set out in PWSC(2017-18)12 concerning the upgrading of part of 763CL, a project in relation to the Integrated Basement for West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") and entitled "Integrated Basement for West Kowloon Cultural District – third stage of construction works", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$3,178.4 million in money-of-the-day prices; and the retention of the remainder of 763CL in Category B. The Chairman declared that he was an independent non-executive director of The Bank of East Asia.

Overall financial arrangement for West Kowloon Cultural District

3. Ms Claudia MO pointed out that the total construction cost of the integrated basement for WKCD was initially estimated at about \$10 billion, but was increased to around \$23 billion due to project delay caused by various reasons. However, FCR(2017-18)42 only set out the information relating to a minor part of the integrated basement construction project. She considered it necessary for the Administration to report the updated estimate for the construction of the entire integrated basement. Dr Helena WONG was also concerned about the finalized costs for the construction of

the entire integrated basement. Project Manager, Home Affairs Bureau ("PM/HAB") responded that the integrated basement for WKCD comprised Zones 2A, 2B, 2C, 3A and 3B. Zones 2A, 2B and 2C of the integrated basement were still at the design stage, and it was expected that the cost estimate for the overall construction project would be available at the end of 2018 and would be reported to the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in early 2019.

4. Ms Tanya CHAN pointed out that when the funding of \$21.6 billion was sought in 2008 for supporting the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD") in implementing the WKCD project, the Administration mentioned that the proceeds from land sales of residential, hotel and office sites at WKCD would be returned to the Government. Ms CHAN expressed dissatisfaction that the Administration granted the development right of the hotel/office/residential sites at WKCD to WKCD after having already injected funds into WKCD, and following that, the Administration went even further by proposing to bear the full cost for the construction of the integrated basement.

5. Ms Tanya CHAN also referred to the remarks made by the Administration in 2013 that it would fully fund and undertake the construction works of the integrated basement in order to enable WKCD to focus on the development of arts and cultural facilities. She was dissatisfied that in the current proposal, WKCD was commissioned by the Administration to undertake the construction works of the integrated basement, and would be paid a sum of about \$60.3 million as in-house management cost.

6. Ms Tanya CHAN was concerned about the finalized cost for the WKCD project. She said that a specialist adviser was appointed by LegCo in 2008 to study the financial aspects of the WKCD project and give advice to the LegCo Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development. Ms CHAN pointed out that the specialist adviser had, at that time, expressed various views on the financial evaluation made by the Administration, and in the end, the Government really had to incessantly make capital injections into WKCD through various means. Ms CHAN highlighted that since 2008, the Civic Party had opposed the appropriation of \$21.6 billion to WKCD for implementing the WKCD project, and it now also objected to the proposals set out in FCR(2017-18)42. She further pointed out that if the terms of reference of the Audit Commission covered the conduct of audits on unfinished project items, she hoped that the Audit Commission would conduct an audit immediately on the accounts of WKCD and the WKCD project.

7. Ms Claudia MO was dissatisfied that the Administration had put forward to FC separate funding proposals at different times for the construction of various facilities at WKCD, thus making it difficult for members to monitor the overall expenditure on the WKCD project. She pointed out that according to the information provided by the Administration in February 2017, in order to complete the Batch 3 core arts and cultural facilities, the two remaining black box theatres in Batch 2 as well as the remaining Other Arts and Cultural Facilities ("OACF"), Retail/Dining/Entertainment ("RDE") facilities and public open spaces (other than the Musical Theatre and the Exhibition Centre which were to be funded by private sector investment), the outstanding capital funding required would be about \$11.7 billion in 2016 prices. Ms MO requested the Administration to indicate clearly the projected cost overrun of the WKCD project and the current financial status of WKCDA.

8. Dr Helena WONG enquired about the updated cost estimate for the WKCD project, and also requested the Administration to clarify whether the funding of \$21.6 billion approved in 2008 was sufficient for the development of WKCD (excluding the integrated basement).

9. PM/HAB did not concur that there was cost overrun of the WKCD project, and pointed out that the conceptual design of incorporating an integrated basement into the project was not yet available when the Administration sought funding approval of \$21.6 billion in 2008 for supporting WKCDA in implementing the WKCD project. Various subsequent developments and changes necessitated the provision of additional funding to support related developments.

10. PM/HAB also said that according to the estimation of WKCDA, the one-off upfront endowment of \$21.6 billion plus the investment income would only be sufficient to cover the design and construction costs of Batch 1 and most of Batch 2 facilities, as well as other related facilities (including RDE and arts and cultural facilities). In order to complete the Batch 3 core arts and cultural facilities, the two remaining black box theatres in Batch 2 as well as the remaining OACF, RDE facilities and public open spaces (other than the Musical Theatre and the Exhibition Centre which were to be funded by private sector investment), the outstanding capital funding required would be about \$11.7 billion in 2016 prices.

11. Dr Fernando CHEUNG opined that before the Administration provided in clear terms the financial analysis reports and the income and expenditure accounts of WKCD under different financial arrangements (including the options of issuing bonds, raising loans and the current

arrangement of the Administration having to bear all construction costs), it was impossible for LegCo to determine the reasonableness of this funding application.

12. PM/HAB pointed out that besides the written reply (i.e. LC Paper No. FC81/17-18(01)) submitted earlier, the Administration would further explain the enhanced financial arrangement for the WKCD project at the meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project ("the Joint Subcommittee") scheduled to be held on 9 February 2018.

Motion to adjourn discussion on item FCR(2017-18)42

13. At 3:31 pm, Mr CHU Hoi-dick moved without notice under paragraph 39 of the Finance Committee Procedure ("FCP") that discussion on item FCR(2017-18)42 be then adjourned. The Chairman proposed the question forthwith that discussion on item FCR(2017-18)42 be adjourned and directed that each member might speak once on the proposed question for not more than three minutes. Mr CHU briefed members on his motion, and expressed dissatisfaction that the relevant principal officials under the accountability system ("accountability officials") and the Permanent Secretary concerned were absent from the meeting. He also considered that the Administration's written reply (LC Paper No. FC81/17-18(01)) had not given a comprehensive response to the questions raised by members.

14. Dr KWOK Ka-ki, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Dr Fernando CHEUNG, Mr WU Chi-wai, Ms Claudia MO, Mr Jeremy TAM, Mr Charles Peter MOK and Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke in support of the motion to adjourn discussion on the item. In brief, they expressed various concerns about the financial arrangement for WKCD; and they held the view that the written reply given by the Government could not answer members' questions, and that FC should continue to scrutinize this funding proposal only after the Administration had provided sufficient information to address members' concerns. By then, the relevant accountability officials should attend the FC meeting concerned.

15. Dr Junius HO and Mr LAU Kwok-fan spoke in opposition to the motion.

16. Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) said that subject to the nature of the items considered by FC, the Administration arranged suitable officials to attend FC meetings.

However, she would convey members' concerns to the relevant bureaux/departments.

17. Mr CHU Hoi-dick spoke in reply in respect of his motion. The Chairman put the motion to vote. At members' request, the Chairman ordered a division, and the motion was negatived. The votes of individual members were set out in **Annex I**.

Other concerns and views

18. Mr Jeremy TAM was concerned about the financial status of the contractor for the WKCD project. He received complaints that the contractor engaged in the floor finishes installation for WKCD's M+ project had not paid salaries to their workers and had not paid material costs as scheduled. As a result, WKCDA had to pay the salaries to the workers concerned directly on behalf of the contractor. Chief Executive Officer, West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("CEO/WKCDA") responded that WKCDA had no direct contractual relationship with the sub-contractors of the main contractor or with the workers employed by them. WKCDA would not pay salaries to non-WKCDA staff. Having made payments to the contractor and its sub-contractors, WKCDA would monitor the payment position closely to ensure that they made the necessary payments of the salary and other related costs to the relevant staff.

[Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. FC120/17-18(01) on 30 January 2018.]

19. Regarding WKCDA's plan to tender out the development of various WKCD items through different Build-Operate-Transfer ("BOT") development packages with private sector investors/partners, Dr Helena WONG expressed her views on the above plan and requested WKCDA to report to LegCo the relevant development packages prior to inviting tenders from private sector investors/partners.

20. In response, PM/HAB pointed out that the Administration would further explain the enhanced financial arrangement for the WKCD project at the meeting of the Joint Subcommittee scheduled to be held on 9 February 2018. CEO/WKCDA supplemented that WKCDA would not sell any of the premises in WKCD during the term of the BOT agreements. The private sector investors/partners would be required to share rental income with WKCDA during the term of the BOT agreements, and to hand back the premises to WKCDA upon the expiry of the BOT period.

Motions proposed by a member under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure

21. At 4:29 pm, FC started to vote on whether the motions proposed by a member under FCP 37A ("FCP 37A motions") should be proceeded with forthwith. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. After the Chairman declared that FC had decided not to proceed with the first FCP 37A motion forthwith, Mr CHAN Hak-kan moved a motion under FCP 47 that in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of any motions or questions under the same agenda item, FC should proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell had been rung for one minute. The Chairman put the motion to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried. The votes of individual members were set out in **Annex II**. FC continued to vote on the questions of whether the remaining FCP 37A motions should be proceeded with forthwith. The voting results of whether FC should proceed with the following FCP 37A motions forthwith were as follows:

Member proposing the motions	Serial nos. of the motions	Whether to proceed with the motions forthwith
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	0001 , 0002 , 0003 , 0004	No

Voting on FCR(2017-18)42

22. There being no further questions from members, the Chairman put item FCR(2017-18)42 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for one minute. The Chairman declared that 27 members voted in favour of and 11 members voted against the item. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him
 Mr CHAN Hak-kan
 Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee
 Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun
 Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming
 Mr MA Fung-kwok
 Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
 Mr KWOK Wai-keung

Mr WONG Ting-kwong
 Mr WONG Kwok-kin
 Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun
 Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
 Mr YIU Si-wing
 Mr CHAN Han-pan
 Ms Alice MAK Mei-kuen
 Dr Elizabeth QUAT

Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong Mr POON Siu-ping
Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan Dr Junius HO Kwan-yiu
Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding Mr SHIU Ka-fai
Mr Wilson OR Chong-shing Ms YUNG Hoi-yan
Dr Pierre CHAN Mr LAU Kwok-fan
Mr Kenneth LAU Ip-keung
(27 members)

Against:

Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung Ms Claudia MO
Mr Charles Peter MOK Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr KWOK Ka-ki Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Mr CHU Hoi-dick Mr LAM Cheuk-ting
Ms Tanya CHAN Dr CHENG Chung-tai
Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho
(11 members)

23. The Chairman declared that the item was approved.

Item No. 2 — FCR(2017-18)43

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE ESTABLISHMENT
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 25 OCTOBER 2017**

EC(2017-18)6

**HEAD 49 — FOOD AND ENVIRONMENTAL HYGIENE
DEPARTMENT**

Subhead 000 — Operational Expenses

24. The Chairman advised that this item sought the approval of FC for the recommendation made by the Establishment Subcommittee at its meeting held on 25 October 2017, i.e. the recommendation set out in EC(2017-18)6 concerning the creation of a supernumerary directorate post (Administrative Officer Staff Grade C) in the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD") for a period of five years with immediate effect upon approval of FC, to lead the newly created Market Division and take forward a fundamental review, so as to revitalize and modernize the hardware, operation and management of markets.

Qualification requirements for the proposed post

25. Members noted that the Administration planned to deploy an Administrative Officer ("AO") within the Government to fill the proposed post. Ms YUNG Hoi-yan and Ms Claudia MO were concerned that

in-house AOs lacked commercial experience, and queried whether an AO was equipped with the new mindset required to improve the existing system. Mr YIU Si-wing enquired whether the Administration would establish specific qualification requirements for the proposed post, and whether it would identify a suitable candidate for the proposed post through other means.

26. Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food)2 ("PAS(FH)(Food)2") responded that AOs, with rich administrative experience, could balance the interests of all parties when formulating new strategies for markets. The incumbent of the proposed post would also listen to the views of others through various channels, and would draw on and make reference to the experience of the commercial sector in business operations in order to facilitate policy making. Deputy Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Administration and Development) ("DD/FEH(A&D)") supplemented that the incumbent of the proposed post would lead his/her team in establishing a new public market regime by capitalizing on the experience of FEHD gained over the past years in managing public markets built at different times, while making reference to the operation models adopted by private markets.

27. Mr KWOK Wai-keung and Ms YUNG Hoi-yan suggested that the Administration should draw on the experience of the private sector in market management. Ms YUNG also suggested that the Administration should, by making reference to overseas experience, bring new ideas to the design of the hardware and the management of public markets. PAS(FH)(Food)2 noted the above suggestions, and pointed out that the proposed post would be responsible for formulating strategies to improve the facilities in and management of public markets, and taking forward the improvement plans.

28. Mr YIU Si-wing supported the setting up of a dedicated team to handle the matters concerned. However, given that the Administration should make continuous efforts in renovating public markets and enhancing the management of public markets, he asked why the proposed post was created as a supernumerary post for a period of only five years. PAS(FH)(Food)2 said that a period of five years was proposed to facilitate the Administration in monitoring the work progress of the proposed post. The Administration would review the effectiveness of the post and consider the need to extend the service period of the team when the five-year term of the post was about to end.

Work direction of the proposed post

29. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen pointed out that the Food and Health Bureau had earlier commissioned a consultancy study on ways to improve the operating environment of public markets. While six public markets were selected for in-depth study, not even one was located in the New Territories East. He asked how the incumbent of the proposed post would select public markets for study in the future. PAS(FH)(Food)2 responded that the consultant, when selecting public markets as representative markets at that time, aimed to select markets of different sizes, and markets in urban and non-urban areas. The scope of work of the proposed post would include all the 100-odd existing public markets.

30. Mr Wilson OR said that members of the public had strong views on the facilities in and management of public markets. He opined that the management problems in public markets originated from the fact that various government departments were involved in the operation of public markets. As an example, he pointed out that FEHD had to liaise with other government departments even for simple maintenance works in public markets such as replacing the electric lights, which took months to complete. Mr OR enquired how the incumbent of the proposed post would coordinate the relevant work and enhance work efficiency.

31. Dr CHENG Chung-tai declared that his relatives and friends were currently working in public markets. He was concerned whether the proposed post would indeed be given more powers and bigger roles in coordinating various government departments in handling public market-related issues, and whether corresponding posts were created in other relevant government departments to enhance their cooperation.

32. DD/FEH(A&D) said that FEHD could not address various issues in public markets solely by itself, and had to work closely with relevant government departments. The creation of the proposed post and establishment of the dedicated team would facilitate coordination among various government departments, and hence would improve the management of public markets.

33. Mr Wilson OR requested the Administration to provide an information paper to further explain how, subsequent to the creation of the proposed post, the coordination among government departments on matters relating to public markets could be improved, and work efficiency be enhanced. The Administration undertook to provide the information requested by Mr OR after the meeting.

34. Mrs Regina IP considered that the specific issues concerning the management and operation of public markets should be discussed in detail in the Subcommittee on Issues Relating to Public Markets. She said that as the Housing Authority ("HA") had encountered similar challenges in managing its public markets, HA decided to divest its markets to private operators years ago. She suggested that the Administration should manage public markets with a new mindset, and she asked the Under Secretary for Food and Health about the strategies to be put forward to improve the management of public markets, so that they were better managed than their private counterparts.

35. Under Secretary for Food and Health said that the Administration was well aware of the roles played by traditional public markets and the challenges inherent in managing public markets. The Administration did not have any pre-conceived plan at this point; instead, it would stay humble, listen to the views of various sectors of the community, and work out new strategies with input from all parties.

Performance indicators for the proposed post

36. Mr KWOK Wai-keung, Mr CHU Hoi-dick, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and Mr YIU Si-wing were concerned that no specific performance indicators had been established for the proposed post in the coming five years. Mr KWOK, Mr CHU and Mr CHAN were dissatisfied that the Administration only stated in abstract terms that the incumbent of the proposed post would strive to make the greatest progress, touching upon only the work direction but not concrete and specific performance indicators. Mr CHAN was worried that without specific targets, nothing would be done after five years, and the public markets built in the future would continue to repeat the same problems in existing public markets.

37. PAS(FH)(Food)2 reiterated that it was neither practical nor feasible to develop an exhaustive list of work targets and schedules for the next five years for the proposed post. The plans and directions of various major tasks to be undertaken by the proposed post had been set out in detail. After reviewing the 100-odd existing public markets, the incumbent of the proposed post would formulate and prioritize the work targets, pursue and implement the enhancement measures in a gradual manner, and modernize the management of public markets. DD/FEH(A&D) supplemented that as many public markets built in the early years were designed to accommodate the needs of itinerant hawkers who were relocated to public markets, the sizes of the stalls were relatively small. With the creation of the proposed post, it was expected that the design and layout of new public

markets would be improved and management problems reduced with a view to meeting present-day social needs.

Management of public markets

Admin

38. Mr Wilson OR said that the customer flow in many public markets stayed low currently, whereas the vacancy rate in these markets was high. He asked about the specific proposals put forward by the Administration to improve the operating environment of public markets. PAS(FH)(Food)2 responded that the incumbent of the proposed post would formulate major plans to improve the facilities in and management of public markets, including plans to enhance the accessibility of public markets. At the request of Mr OR, the Administration agreed to provide a supplementary information paper after the meeting to further explain the matter.

39. Ms Claudia MO was of the view that at present, members of the public preferred patronizing supermarkets or open-air markets. She was concerned whether the creation of the proposed post could change the public's consumption pattern. DD/FEH(A&D) pointed out that customers' consumption pattern had been changing continuously over the years. The incumbent of the proposed post would comprehensively review the facilities in and management of public markets.

Rentals

40. Dr CHENG Chung-tai and Mr YIU Si-wing were concerned whether the rentals or management fees of public markets would be increased upon market revitalization. Dr CHENG suggested that a rental concession mechanism should be established to offer preferential rental rates on the basis of the specific conditions of individual public markets, such as aged facilities or high vacancy rate. Mr YIU enquired how the rentals would be adjusted after market revitalization.

41. PAS(FH)(Food)2 said that the Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene ("FSEH Panel") was consulted in March 2017 on the proposed public market rental adjustment. The proposed post would be responsible for reviewing the policies on and adjustment mechanism for the rentals and fees of market stalls, and listening to the views of all parties. DD/FEH(A&D) supplemented that the rentals of public markets had been frozen for 20 years since 1998, except once in 2017 when the rental adjustment was made according to the change in the Consumer Price Index in the previous year. The Administration considered that a reasonable rental adjustment mechanism could prompt tenants to make good use of their stalls, thus bringing benefits to consumers ultimately.

Market Management Consultative Committees

42. Mr KWOK Wai-keung said that the existing operation of Market Management Consultative Committees ("MMCCs") was rather closed, and even LegCo Members found it difficult to take part in MMCCs. He asked about the Administration's improvement plans in this respect. Mr SHIU Ka-chun relayed to the meeting his experience in following up on issues relating to the management of Heung Che Street Market by stating that FEHD did not take any action until after two rounds of meetings between FEHD and he himself. In his view, it was imperative for the Administration to enhance communication with stakeholders and address problems in a proactive manner.

43. Dr Fernando CHEUNG enquired about the ways in which the Administration would enhance its communication with various stakeholders of the 100-odd existing public markets, as well as the target groups with whom the Administration would communicate and the specific work schedule for such communication. He also suggested that the Market Offices under FEHD should be open to different stakeholders of public markets in order to facilitate communication. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen asked whether residents and community groups would be allowed to participate in the management of and decision-making process for public markets. Mr Wilson OR suggested that the Administration should make reference to the practices adopted by the Estate Management Advisory Committee of HA by earmarking funds for conducting minor maintenance works in a flexible manner. He also requested the Administration to provide supplementary information on measures to enhance the operation of MMCCs.

Admin

44. PAS(FH)(Food)2 pointed out that the currently, the Administration mainly consulted District Councils, MMCCs, stallholders and relevant stakeholders, and the Administration had been maintaining communication with them. When commissioning a consultant to conduct a detailed study earlier, the Administration organized consultation sessions and expanded the targeted groups to include academics, consumers and members of the public. The proposed post would be responsible for reviewing the existing mechanism and enhancing engagement with relevant stakeholders in order to achieve the aim of improving the management of public markets. DD/FEH(A&D) noted the suggestions raised by members, and said that the Administration would collect views and review the mechanism concerned with an open-minded attitude. The Administration expected that an effective consultation mechanism could attract input from users and expedite the implementation of enhancement projects in public markets.

Hygiene

45. Referring to the serious rodent problem in public markets, Mr SHIU Ka-chun enquired about the effectiveness of the two phases of anti-rodent campaign completed in 2017, and the new mindset in addressing the long-standing rodent problem.

46. PAS(FH)(Food)2 said that ongoing efforts had been made to combat the rodent problem. As for the two phases of anti-rodent campaign in 2017, the Administration had reported to the FSEH Panel that the campaign was effective and well supported by the public. DD/FEH(A&D) supplemented that the District Environmental Hygiene Offices under FEHD would take targeted measures to address the hygiene problems in each market.

47. Ms Claudia MO suggested that the Administration should make reference to the practices of HA which exercised its discretion of allowing stallholders in public markets to keep cats in their stalls to combat the infestation of rodents in markets. She also suggested that the air-conditioning in public markets should be switched off in winter, while windows and doors should be opened to improve fresh air ventilation and reduce the concentration of odorous constituents in public markets.

48. Assistant Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Operations)2 said that in accordance with the tenancy agreements, the stallholders in public markets were not allowed to keep cats in their stalls. PAS(FH)(Food)2 added that the Administration had received many views on the keeping of cats in public markets (including an earlier question raised by a Member at a LegCo meeting), and would continue to communicate with stakeholders on the management of public markets.

Facilities in public markets

Barrier-free facilities

49. Dr Fernando CHEUNG was concerned that the accessibility of the existing public markets was not satisfactory, and FCR(2017-18)43 did not put forward any plan to install barrier-free facilities in markets. He considered that the Administration should, with the aim of making public markets completely barrier-free, accord priority to improving the passages, toilets, etc. to facilitate the access of the elderly and the disabled to public markets.

Admin

50. Dr Fernando CHEUNG enquired about the number of public markets which were completely barrier-free among the 100-odd existing public markets. Moreover, with respect to the Administration's plan that the installation of barrier-free facilities in public markets according to the Design Manual would commence in tandem with other enhancement projects to be undertaken in the public markets concerned, Dr CHEUNG was worried that such a plan would greatly delay the progress of installing barrier-free facilities in the 100-odd existing public markets. He urged the Administration to change the current mindset and the improvement works should commence immediately. He also requested the Administration to provide a time frame for improving and completing the installation of barrier-free access in all public markets. Mr SHIU Ka-chun supplemented that there were not enough symbols of accessibility, braille cells and tactile maps in public markets and toilets at present. He pointed out that the installation of such facilities was relatively simple and did not involve structural modifications. He urged the Administration to accord priority to addressing this problem.

51. PAS(FH)(Food)2 said that the proposed post and the team led by the post were responsible for formulating strategies for implementing major plans to improve the facilities in and management of public markets, which included reviewing the accessibility of public markets, and installing barrier-free facilities in the 100-odd existing public markets wherever practicable. DD/FEH(A&D) said that one of the objectives of creating the proposed post was to improve the operating environment and accessibility of public markets. The Administration would proceed to improve the 100-odd existing public markets gradually in order of priority, taking into account the general layout of each market.

Construction of new markets

52. Ms Claudia MO and Mr Holden CHOW suggested that when identifying suitable sites for constructing new markets, the Administration should not only consider the needs of residents in the New Territories or New Development Areas ("NDAs"), but also the needs of people in various districts across Hong Kong. Mr James TO enquired whether the Administration had already identified the sites for constructing new public markets, and whether the incumbent of the proposed post would conduct a comprehensive review of these sites. PAS(FH)(Food)2 clarified that the study on the construction of new markets to be conducted by the incumbent of the proposed post would not be confined to the New Territories or NDAs, but would cover the situation of those districts which claimed to be lacking in market facilities by studying the need for and feasibility of

constructing new public markets in such districts. DD/FEH(A&D) added that apart from constructing new markets, the proposed post would also be responsible for reviewing the conditions of the 100-odd existing public markets and formulating an overall strategy.

53. Mr James TO opined that the Administration would not be able to consider the issue in a holistic manner if the quantity of existing market facilities in a district was the sole factor for determining whether a public market should be constructed in a particular district. He quoted the complaints lodged by some residents that all the markets in their districts were commercially managed without the provision of public markets. The prices of goods were, as a result, expensive as these private markets were monopolized by one operator. Mr TO asked whether the lack of effective competition would be viewed as a factor for consideration when the incumbent of the proposed post examined the public's demand for new public markets. Mr CHU Hoi-dick and Mr Holden CHOW also suggested that the Administration should consider building new public markets in districts where there was no effective competition (such as the districts in which only markets managed by Link Asset Management Limited were available) in order to meet the needs of the community.

54. PAS(FH)(Food)2 said that the Administration would listen to the views of the public, and would consider, in a holistic manner, the community's demand for public markets.

55. Regarding the problem of private markets being monopolized by one single operator, Mr CHU Hoi-dick suggested that the Administration should consider formulating new planning guidelines for the construction of public markets. He also pointed out that there were no clear planning standards for the construction of public markets in the existing Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines ("HKPSG"). He enquired about the standards adopted by the Administration for deciding whether new public markets would be built, and he asked whether more than one public market would be built in the same district.

56. PAS(FH)(Food)2 said that as mentioned in the Policy Address delivered by the Chief Executive ("CE"), suitable sites would be identified in NDAs for constructing sizable public markets. She also clarified that relevant provisions were set out in the existing HKPSG to serve as reference. DD/FEH(A&D) said that the Administration would, in the light of community needs, consider building more than one public market in the same district, if practicable.

Mode of management in public markets

57. Dr Fernando CHEUNG and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen were concerned that the Administration intended to introduce a new management mode in public markets. They enquired whether the Administration planned to adopt the single-operator letting arrangement for its markets and if so, of the relevant details. Dr CHEUNG opposed outsourcing the management of public markets, in whatever forms (including the single-operator letting arrangement). Mr CHAN considered that in case the single-operator letting arrangement was adopted for public markets, there was no need to create the proposed post.

58. Referring to reports that the Administration intended to operate public markets through non-governmental organizations, Mr SHIU Ka-chun sought clarification from the Administration on the details, and enquired how such operators would be selected. He also opposed the adoption of the single-operator letting arrangement for public markets.

59. PAS(FH)(Food)2 said that the single-operator letting arrangement for public markets was merely one of the recommendations put forward in the consultancy study conducted earlier. The Administration had not yet finalized its plan. DD/FEH(A&D) said that the Administration had no plan to contract out the operation and management of public markets. He further pointed out that in response to CE's announcement in the Policy Address that the operation and management of public markets would be enhanced, the Administration was currently considering the relevant enhancement measures. The incumbent of the proposed post and the team led by the post would consider all relevant views in the hope that newly-built public markets could meet the needs of the community.

60. Referring to the allegations made by stallholders in public markets that some consortiums or chain shops were gradually monopolizing several types of food stalls, Dr CHENG Chung-tai urged the Administration to address the issue and maintain healthy competition among stallholders in public markets. DD/FEH(A&D) said that it was the Government's established policy to encourage healthy competition in order to obtain the best economic return. The proposed post would review the methods of and mechanism for letting out stalls in public markets for the dual purpose of encouraging healthy competition and enhancing social benefits.

The 11 public markets that had secured 80% tenant support for the installation of air-conditioning systems

61. Mr KWOK Wai-keung and Dr Fernando CHEUNG enquired about the progress of installing air-conditioning systems in the 11 public markets which had secured 80% tenant support. Dr CHEUNG urged the Administration to expeditiously submit to FC the funding proposal relating to Tai Wai Market, and to accord priority to livelihood-related funding proposals.

62. Regarding the 11 public markets which had secured 80% tenant support for the installation of air-conditioning systems, PAS(FH)(Food)2 said that:

- (a) regarding Tai Wai Market, the Administration would consult the FSEH Panel on the relevant proposal in March 2018. Subject to FC's approval, the project would be launched at the end of 2018 and was expected to complete in 2020. After obtaining 80% tenant support for the installation of air-conditioning system in 2014, the Administration had already begun installing facilities such as ventilation fans in Tai Wai Market in order to reduce its indoor temperature;
- (b) regarding Ngau Tau Kok Market, Shui Wo Street Market and Aberdeen Market, the Administration would commence the works shortly. Preliminary agreement had been reached with the stallholders in Ngau Tau Kok Market and Shui Wo Street Market on the arrangement of the projects;
- (c) regarding the remaining seven public markets, the Administration would further explore with the Architectural Services Department ("ArchSD") on the details of the projects concerned, and would report to FSEH Panel in due course; and
- (d) with the enhancement of manpower in ArchSD, it was expected that the improvement works in a number of public markets could be proceeded with concurrently.

63. Mr KWOK Wai-keung, Dr Fernando CHEUNG and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen were dissatisfied that the Administration refused to establish specific targets which should be achieved by the incumbent of the proposed post in the next five years in respect of the progress of installing air-conditioning systems in these 11 public markets. Mr KWOK was

worried that without specific targets, the works of installing air-conditioning systems in these 11 public markets could not be completed after five years. Mr CHAN further asked about the extent to which the progress of installing air-conditioning systems in individual markets could be expedited after the proposed post was created.

64. Regarding the installation of air-conditioning system in Tai Wai Market, Dr Fernando CHEUNG pointed out that while the relevant stallholders had strived for it for more than 20 years and a number of LegCo Members had followed up on the case for years, the project had yet to commence. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen said that despite the personal involvement of the then Secretary for Food and Health, the work progress had been slow. He queried whether the proposed post and the team led by the post could expedite the work progress.

65. Regarding the Administration's earlier remarks that higher efficiency could be achieved by private market operators when conducting major renovation works in markets because private operators usually requested tenants to cease operation to tie in with the progress of works, Mr KWOK Wai-keung said that the construction period of ArchSD's projects for installing air-conditioning systems in public markets (usually 18 months) was much longer than that of similar projects carried out by private market operators (usually three months only). He suggested that the Administration should, by drawing on the experience of private market operators, modify its prevailing practices, so as to reduce the impact of such projects on the stallholders and consumers during the construction period.

66. DD/FEH(A&D) said that FEHD, vested with the role to manage markets, would cooperate fully with ArchSD regarding project implementation. However, there were numerous potential challenges in installing air-conditioning systems in the existing markets. As it was often necessary to relocate some stalls in the process of installing air-conditioning system in order to provide space for storage of the electrical and mechanical facilities, it took time for the Administration to discuss such arrangements with stallholders. The incumbent of the proposed post, together with the dedicated team under its charge, would strive to proceed with the relevant projects. With the establishment of the dedicated team, it was possible to commence the installation projects in various public markets concurrently.

Questions on individual markets

67. Regarding the consultancy study report on ways to improve the operating environment of public markets commissioned by the Food and Health Bureau earlier, Mr Jeremy TAM enquired about the proposal of re-zoning the stalls in Tsuen Wan Market, as well as whether the earlier proposal had been revised. DD/FEH(A&D) responded that there were altogether six representative markets selected by the consultant for detailed study and specific improvement recommendations were put forward by the consultant. The Administration would, before making a decision on the final proposal, further discuss with the affected stall tenants on the recommendations of the consultant.

68. Mr KWONG Chun-yu said that residents in Tin Shui Wai had always been eager to have public markets in the locality in order to address the problems associated with the lack of competition in the operation of markets. He enquired about the location of the new Tin Shui Wai Public Market, the progress of the work concerned and in what way the Administration would consult the public. He was also concerned how the creation of the proposed post would facilitate the relevant work. DD/FEH(A&D) said that the Administration was examining the public's views that had been put forward on the location of the new Tin Shui Wai Public Market, and would report the progress of work and details in due course. The proposed post would be responsible for reviewing the design and layout of public markets, enhancing their accessibility and hygienic conditions, and formulating strategies for improving the operation of public markets.

69. Mr CHU Hoi-dick said that it was the hope of residents in Tung Chung to have a new public market in the town centre of Tung Chung, instead of Tung Chung New Town Extension Area. He was also concerned that the construction of the public market might take more than three years if it was incorporated into a comprehensive development plan (i.e. a "single site, multiple use" initiative). In this connection, he requested the Administration to clarify how it would make its choice. Mr Holden CHOW considered that apart from the demand for market facilities in Tung Chung New Town Extension Area, the Administration should also cater for the needs of residents currently residing in Tung Chung by constructing new public markets at the town centre.

70. DD/FEH(A&D) said that Tung Chung New Town Extension Area was at the planning stage, and the details had yet to be confirmed. As mentioned by CE in the Policy Address, the proposed post would be

responsible for identifying suitable sites in Tung Chung New Town Extension Area for constructing sizable public markets. The Administration would also examine the situation of those districts which claimed to be lacking in market facilities by studying the need for and feasibility of constructing new public markets in such districts. PAS(FH)(Food)2 supplemented that the Development Bureau would explore how to pursue "single site, multiple use" in multi-storey developments on government land. The Administration would build new public markets under the most suitable mode.

71. Referring to the earlier suggestions made by residents' groups on the Wing Fong Street Market project, including the construction of a complex building at Hing Fong Road Playground for reprovisioning the market, Mr CHU Hoi-dick asked how the Administration would deal with the suggestions. PAS(FH)(Food)2 said that the Administration would consider their suggestions, and in the long run, the incumbent of the proposed post would continue to listen to the views of the community on public market issues.

72. At 5:17 pm, the Chairman directed that the meeting be suspended for members to take a short break. The meeting resumed at 5:30 pm.

A motion proposed by a member under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure

73. At 7:11 pm, FC started to vote on whether the FCP 37A motion proposed by a member should be proceeded with forthwith. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The question on whether the [FCP 37A motion](#) proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen should be proceeded with forthwith was negatived.

Voting on FCR(2017-18)43

74. There being no further questions from members on this item, the Chairman put this item to vote. The Chairman stated that he thought that the majority of the members present and voting were in favour of the item. The item was approved.

Item No. 3 — FCR(2017-18)44
2017-18 JUDICIAL SERVICE PAY ADJUSTMENT

75. The Chairman advised that this item sought the approval of FC for increasing the pay for judges and judicial officers ("JJOs") by 2.95% with effect from 1 April 2017. The Administration Wing consulted the Panel on Administration of Justice and Legal Services ("AJLS Panel") on the proposal on 30 October 2017.

76. Mr Dennis KWOK said that AJLS Panel supported the granting of approval for item FCR(2017-18)44. Mr KWOK and Dr CHENG Chung-tai were concerned about the long-standing problem of manpower shortage and brain drain at different court levels of the Judiciary. Mr KWOK requested the Director of Administration ("DoA") to convey to the Judiciary the views expressed by members: the next round of recruitment exercise for JJOs should be expeditiously conducted; the salaries of JJOs should be further increased; and enhancement of JJOs' remuneration packages should be considered. DoA said that she would convey the relevant views to the Judiciary Administrator.

77. Mr Dennis KWOK also suggested that the Judiciary should complete the study on extension of the retirement age of JJOs as soon as possible. DoA responded that the Judiciary submitted the relevant report in December 2017. The Administration would expeditiously complete its examination of the report, and would, if necessary, launch the relevant law amendment exercise as early as possible.

78. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen pointed out that the pay level of JJOs in Hong Kong was higher than those in other places. Mr CHAN and Dr CHENG Chung-tai enquired whether a detailed study had been conducted on the reasons for the long-standing difficulties currently faced by the Judiciary in recruiting JJOs.

79. In response, DoA said that according to the Benchmark Study on the Earnings of Legal Practitioners in Hong Kong conducted by the Standing Committee on Judicial Salaries and Conditions of Service in 2015, the barrister and solicitor interviewees who were interested in joining the Judiciary cited that the main factor of consideration was not judicial pay, but the chance to serve the community as well as the prestige and honour of being a Judge. As for those who were not interested in joining the Judiciary, they cited that the reasons included lack of freedom and privacy, and demanding workload. Moreover, the survey revealed that

some interviewees were more interested in joining the Judiciary in the later part of their career when financial security had been attained.

Voting on FCR(2017-18)44

80. There being no further questions from members on this item, the Chairman put the item to vote. The Chairman stated that he thought that the majority of the members present and voting were in favour of the item. The item was approved.

81. The meeting ended at 7:23 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat
21 February 2019

點名表決 DIVISION: 1
日期 DATE: 05/01/2018
時間 TIME: 04:12:55 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 動議中止議程文件 FCR(2017-18)42 - PWSC(2017-18)12 的討論
Motion that discussion on FCR(2017-18)42 - PWSC(2017-18)12 be now adjourned

動議人 MOVED BY:

出席 Present : 46
投票 Vote : 45
贊成 Yes : 14
反對 No : 31
棄權 Abstain : 0
結果 Result : 否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	出席	PRESENT	黃碧雲	Dr Helena WONG	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	葉建源	IP Kin-yuen		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葛珮帆	Dr Elizabeth QUAT	反對	NO
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	廖長江	Martin LIAO	反對	NO
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			潘兆平	POON Siu-ping	反對	NO
李國麟	Prof Joseph LEE			蔣麗芸	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan		
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	盧偉國	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok		
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	鍾國斌	CHUNG Kwok-pan	反對	NO
李慧琼	Starry LEE	反對	NO	楊岳橋	Alvin YEUNG		
陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	反對	NO	尹兆堅	Andrew WAN		
梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對	NO	朱凱迪	CHU Hoi-dick	贊成	YES
黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	反對	NO	吳永嘉	Jimmy NG		
葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP			何君堯	Dr Junius HO	反對	NO
謝偉俊	Paul TSE	反對	NO	何啟明	HO Kai-ming	反對	NO
毛孟靜	Claudia MO	贊成	YES	林卓廷	LAM Cheuk-ting	贊成	YES
田北辰	Michael TIEN	反對	NO	周浩鼎	Holden CHOW	反對	NO
何俊賢	Steven HO	反對	NO	邵家輝	SHIU Ka-fai	反對	NO
易志明	Frankie YICK	反對	NO	邵家臻	SHIU Ka-chun		
胡志偉	WU Chi-wai	贊成	YES	柯創盛	Wilson OR	反對	NO
姚思榮	YIU Si-wing	反對	NO	容海恩	YUNG Hoi-yan	反對	NO
馬逢國	MA Fung-kwok	反對	NO	陳沛然	Dr Pierre CHAN	反對	NO
莫乃光	Charles Peter MOK	贊成	YES	陳振英	CHAN Chun-ying		
陳志全	CHAN Chi-chuen	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
陳恒鎮	CHAN Han-pan	反對	NO	張國鈞	CHEUNG Kwok-kwan		
梁志祥	LEUNG Che-cheung	反對	NO	許智峯	HUI Chi-fung		
梁繼昌	Kenneth LEUNG			陸頌雄	LUK Chung-hung	反對	NO
麥美娟	Alice MAK	反對	NO	劉國勳	LAU Kwok-fan	反對	NO
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES	劉業強	Kenneth LAU	反對	NO
郭偉強	KWOK Wai-keung	反對	NO	鄭松泰	Dr CHENG Chung-tai	贊成	YES
郭榮鏗	Dennis KWOK			鄭俊宇	KWONG Chun-yu		
張華峰	Christopher CHEUNG			譚文豪	Jeremy TAM	贊成	YES
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES				

點名表決 DIVISION: 3
日期 DATE: 05/01/2018
時間 TIME: 04:41:22 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 動議其後就相同議程項目下任何議案或待議議題進行點名表決時，委員會須在點名表決鐘聲響起一分鐘後進行點名表決
Motion that in the event of further divisions being claimed of any motions or questions under the same agenda item, the Committee do proceed such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute

動議人 MOVED BY:

出席 Present : 36
投票 Vote : 35
贊成 Yes : 22
反對 No : 13
棄權 Abstain : 0
結果 Result : 通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	出席	PRESENT	黃碧雲	Dr Helena WONG		
涂謹申	James TO			葉建源	IP Kin-yuen		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	葛珮帆	Dr Elizabeth QUAT	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	廖長江	Martin LIAO	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			潘兆平	POON Siu-ping	贊成	YES
李國麟	Prof Joseph LEE			蔣麗芸	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan		
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM			盧偉國	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok		
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES	鍾國斌	CHUNG Kwok-pan	贊成	YES
李慧琼	Starry LEE			楊岳橋	Alvin YEUNG		
陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES	尹兆堅	Andrew WAN		
梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG			朱凱迪	CHU Hoi-dick	反對	NO
黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES	吳永嘉	Jimmy NG		
葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP			何君堯	Dr Junius HO	贊成	YES
謝偉俊	Paul TSE			何啟明	HO Kai-ming		
毛孟靜	Claudia MO	反對	NO	林卓廷	LAM Cheuk-ting	反對	NO
田北辰	Michael TIEN			周浩鼎	Holden CHOW	贊成	YES
何俊賢	Steven HO	贊成	YES	邵家輝	SHIU Ka-fai	贊成	YES
易志明	Frankie YICK	贊成	YES	邵家臻	SHIU Ka-chun		
胡志偉	WU Chi-wai			柯創盛	Wilson OR	贊成	YES
姚思榮	YIU Si-wing	贊成	YES	容海恩	YUNG Hoi-yan	贊成	YES
馬逢國	MA Fung-kwok	反對	NO	陳沛然	Dr Pierre CHAN	反對	NO
莫乃光	Charles Peter MOK	反對	NO	陳振英	CHAN Chun-ying		
陳志全	CHAN Chi-chuen	反對	NO	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	反對	NO
陳恒鎮	CHAN Han-pan	贊成	YES	張國鈞	CHEUNG Kwok-kwan		
梁志祥	LEUNG Che-cheung	贊成	YES	許智峯	HUI Chi-fung		
梁繼昌	Kenneth LEUNG			陸頌雄	LUK Chung-hung		
麥美娟	Alice MAK	贊成	YES	劉國勳	LAU Kwok-fan	贊成	YES
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對	NO	劉業強	Kenneth LAU	贊成	YES
郭偉強	KWOK Wai-keung	贊成	YES	鄭松泰	Dr CHENG Chung-tai	反對	NO
郭榮鏗	Dennis KWOK			鄭俊宇	KWONG Chun-yu		
張華峰	Christopher CHEUNG			譚文豪	Jeremy TAM	反對	NO
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO				

秘書 CLERK

