

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)530/19-20
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PL/PS

Panel on Public Service

**Minutes of meeting held on
Monday, 20 January 2020, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP (Chairman)
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, SBS, JP
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon HO Kai-ming
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon SHIU Ka-fai, JP
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN
Hon CHAN Chun-ying, JP
Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members absent : Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP

Member attending : Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

**Public Officers
attending**

: **Agenda item III**

Mr Joshua LAW, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Mr Thomas CHOW, JP
Permanent Secretary for the Civil Service

Ms Amy WONG, JP
Deputy Secretary for the Civil Service 2

Agenda item IV

Mr Joshua LAW, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Mr Thomas CHOW, JP
Permanent Secretary for the Civil Service

Mr Brian LO, JP
Deputy Secretary for the Civil Service 1

**Attendance by
invitation**

: **Agenda item III**

Hong Kong Customs and Excise Customs Officer
Grade Association

Miss HO Kit-yan
Chairman

Hong Kong Customs and Excise Staff General
Association

Mr CHAN Siu-kau
Chairman

Hong Kong Correctional Services Department
Assistant Officers General Association

Mr TAM Wai-fu
Chairman

Customs Officer Grade Branch of the Hong Kong
Chinese Civil Servants' Association

Mr NG Kwong-lun
Chairman

Clerk in attendance : Mr Anthony CHU
Chief Council Secretary (4)1

Staff in attendance : Ms Maggie CHUNG
Senior Council Secretary (4)1

Miss Carol WONG
Council Secretary (4)1

Mr Griffin FUNG
Legislative Assistant (4)7

Action

**I. Information papers issued since the last regular meeting on
16 December 2019**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)202/19-20(01) -- Information paper from
the Administration on the
civil service
establishment and
training matters in
relation to the tree
management work of the
Leisure and Cultural
Services Department

LC Paper No. CB(4)206/19-20(01) -- Letter dated 13 December
2019 from Dr Hon Pierre
CHAN requesting
information on the
medical benefits for civil
service eligible persons
(Chinese version only)

LC Paper No. CB(4)240/19-20(01) -- Administration's response to the letter dated 13 December 2019 from Dr Hon Pierre CHAN requesting information on the medical benefits for civil service eligible persons)

Members noted that the above papers had been issued since the last regular meeting on 16 December 2019.

II. Date of next meeting and items for discussion

(LC Paper No. CB(4)256/19-20(01) -- List of outstanding items for discussion

LC Paper No. CB(4)256/19-20(02) -- List of follow-up actions)

2. The Chairman drew members' attention to the information paper provided by the Administration regarding the civil service establishment and training matters in relation to the tree management work of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (item 15 of the "List of outstanding items for discussion"), and invited views of members on the Administration's proposal to delete the item from the List. Members had no objection to the deletion.

Items for next regular meeting

3. Members agreed that the next regular meeting of the Panel on Public Service ("the Panel") would be held on 17 February 2020 to discuss the following items proposed by the Administration:

- (a) Creation of a Principal Executive Officer Post in the General Grades Office under the Civil Service Bureau ("CSB"); and
- (b) Use of agency workers.

Creation of a Principal Executive Officer Post in the General Grades Office under CSB

4. Mr Jeremy TAM requested the Administration to include additional information on postings of Executive Officers, i.e. actual and target timing of postings by ranks, in the paper for the item "Creation of a Principal Executive Officer Post in the General Grades Office under the Civil Service Bureau".

Use of agency workers

5. Members raised no objection on inviting representatives of the Innovation and Technology Bureau for discussion of the employment of information technology contract staff engaged under a term contract centrally administered by the Office of the Government Chief Information Officer. Mr HO Kai-ming proposed to invite the agency companies and the agency workers engaged by the Hospital Authority ("HA") to attend the meeting in view of the quite substantial number of agency workers. Understanding the difficulties of inviting the agency workers hired by HA, members agreed that HA should be invited to send representatives to attend the coming meeting.

(Post-meeting note: The Panel meeting on 17 February 2020 was cancelled due to the latest situation of the Coronavirus Disease 2019. With the concurrence of the Chairman, and after consultation with CSB, the regular Panel meeting on 16 March 2020 would discuss "Civil service-related matters featured in the 2020-2021 Budget" and "Use of agency workers" which was originally scheduled for discussion at the regular meeting on 17 February 2020. Representatives of the Innovation and Technology Bureau and HA were invited to attend the meeting for the item "Use of agency workers". The item "Creation of a Principal Executive Officer Post in the General Grades Office under the Civil Service Bureau" would be deferred to a future meeting. Notice of meeting was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)354/19-20 on 26 February 2020.)

Items for future meetings

Political neutrality of civil servants and staff of Government-funded public bodies, and interdiction of civil servants due to illegal public activities

6. Mr IP Kin-yuen enquired about the schedule to discuss the issue of political neutrality of civil servants and interdiction arrangement of civil servants arrested when participating in public activities. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting commented that there was an urgent need to discuss these two issues as a number of civil servants were interdicted due to indiscriminate arrests by the Police in public activities.

7. The Chairman replied that he had decided not to discuss the arrests of civil servants for participating in public activities as the discussion might touch upon ongoing litigation and legal proceedings. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting described the Chairman's decision ridiculous and suggested that instead of individual cases, the policies of interdiction of civil servants could be discussed. He further said that the Chairman was "stupid". As he refused to withdraw his remark used against the Chairman, the Chairman ordered that Mr LAM should withdraw from the meeting. Mr LAM left the meeting room.

8. While generally agreeing to the Chairman's opinion on not discussing individual cases, Mr HO Kai-ming admitted that there was a genuine need to discuss the mechanism on the interdiction of civil servants. He suggested limiting the discussion to only relevant policies, but not touching upon individual cases. Mr IP Kin-yuen and Dr CHIANG Lai-wan also agreed to Mr HO's suggestion. Mr HO further proposed that the Administration should provide codes of conduct of Government-funded public bodies to the Panel for discussion of political neutrality of employees of these organizations.

9. The Chairman drew members' attention that Mr LAM Cheuk-ting had sent in a letter on 17 January 2020 regarding interdiction of civil servants arrested for participating in illegal public activities. After the Administration's response to Mr LAM's letter about interdiction of civil servants was received, members might consider whether the relevant matters should be discussed at a Panel meeting.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's response was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)483/19-20(02) on 17 April 2020.)

Enactment of legislation to prohibit acts of insulting public officers

10. In view of increasing number of burglary cases in recent months, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan requested the Administration to review the manpower requirements of the Hong Kong Police Force ("HKPF"). She also questioned about the progress of CSB on the study of enactment of

legislation to prohibit acts of insulting public officers. Ms Elizabeth QUAT suggested the Administration made reference to Macau's example on the enactment of a similar legislation which also prohibited acts of insulting the public.

11. Secretary for the Civil Service ("SCS") said that the Security Bureau ("SB") was studying related overseas legislation and seeking the Department of Justice's opinion on the matter. No timetable could be provided at this stage.

III. Grade structure review of disciplined services

(File Ref.: CSBCR/PG/4-085-001/57 -- Legislative Council
Brief: Grade Structure
Review for the
Disciplined Services
Grades

LC Paper No. CB(4)1244/18-19(01) -- Administration's response
to the submissions from
related staff
unions/associations
expressing views on the
issue of "Grade
Structure Review for
the Disciplined Services
Grades")

Presentation of views by deputations

12. The Chairman welcomed the deputations to present their views to the Panel. He reminded them that, when addressing the Panel at the meeting, the deputations were not covered by the protection and immunity under the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382), and their written submissions were not covered by the Ordinance either. In total, four deputations presented their views at the meeting.

13. In gist, the major concerns/requests of the deputations were as follows:

- (a) starting salaries of new recruits, incremental points and pay scales of six disciplined services in the civil service should be aligned;
- (b) the Administration should reduce the conditioned working hours of staff in the Customs and Excise Department ("C&ED") and the Correctional Services Department ("CSD") from 48 to 44 hours per week for better work-life balance;
- (c) the Administration should provide post-retirement medical and dental benefits, local education allowance and increase leave entitlement for staff appointed on or after 1 June 2000 on New Terms ("NT");
- (d) the "through scale arrangement" for officer rank in HKPF and the Fire Services Department should be critically reviewed, as other disciplined services in the civil service did not have such an arrangement;
- (e) as a result of the opening of new boundary control points and the introduction of new legislation e.g. regulation on export of powdered formula and the Trade Descriptions (Unfair Trade Practices) (Amendment) Ordinance 2012, the workload of C&ED had become heavier. The creation of an additional Deputy Commissioner position and an additional Assistant Commissioner position in the department was considered necessary;
- (f) the current level of Extra Duties Allowances for the disciplined services in C&ED, such as that for driving and detective duties, was considered inadequate and did not provide sufficient incentive for staff to perform additional duties;
- (g) the quarters policy should be reviewed as officer rank staff appointed on NT would no longer be eligible for departmental quarters once they reached point 20 on the General Disciplined Services (Officer) Pay Scale;
- (h) in view of the fast changing working environment, grade structure review ("GSR") for disciplined services should be conducted once every five years instead of ten; and

- (i) the Administration should examine if the three pre-requisites, namely (i) being cost neutral; (ii) not involving additional manpower; and (iii) maintaining the same level of service to the public, had to be met for any proposals to reduce conditioned working hours.

14. A summary of the deputations' views was in the **Appendix**.

Response by the Administration

15. SCS responded that as the GSR for the disciplined services was still in progress, he would not comment on the views expressed and recommendations made by the deputations at this stage. The civil service pay policy was to offer sufficient remuneration to attract, retain and motivate staff of a suitable calibre to provide the public with an effective and efficient service; and to maintain broad comparability between civil service pay and private sector pay. As it was difficult to identify comparable positions and job types in the private sector for the disciplined services, and individual disciplined services grades were also facing persistent recruitment or retention difficulties, the Chief Executive-in-Council decided in October 2018 to conduct a GSR for the disciplined services. The Executive Council also agreed to conduct a GSR for the disciplined services once every 10 years in future to ensure that the grade structures and remuneration of the disciplined services were effective in attracting and retaining talents.

16. SCS further said that the Standing Committee on Disciplined Services Salaries and Conditions of Service ("SCDS") and the Standing Committee on Directorate Salaries and Conditions of Service ("SDCS") were working independently on the GSR in accordance with their terms of reference and the framework of the review. SCDS and SDCS had invited both the management and staff sides of all disciplined services to submit their views, conducted visits to the disciplined services departments and met with representatives of both the management and staff sides of the disciplined services, to better understand their work and listen to their views. All comments and suggestions made by the deputations and members at the meeting on the GSR for the disciplined services would be relayed to SCDS and SDCS for their thorough consideration in the course of the review. Upon completion of the GSR and submission of the reports by the two Committees to the Government in due course, the Administration would duly consult all stakeholders including the relevant Panel(s) of the Legislative Council on the recommendations of the GSR, and submit the proposed way forward for consideration of and a decision by the Chief Executive-in-Council. If

the final recommendations involved changes to the grade structures of the disciplined services or had financial implications, the approval of the Finance Committee of the Legislative Council would also be sought.

Discussion

Uniformity of pay scales, benefits and working hours

17. Mr Jeremy TAM supported that, for the sake of equity, the pay scales and benefits of the disciplined services should be aligned. In case of additional or dangerous duties, special allowances should be granted to the staff concerned. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan commented that different disciplined services had their own difficulties and risks in performing duties, no individual disciplined service should be treated more favourably in terms of salaries or benefits. Mr IP Kin-yuen shared a similar view as Dr CHIANG. Both the Chairman and the Deputy Chairman were concerned about the differences in the benefits enjoyed by staff employed before and after 1 June 2000 respectively which might affect staff morale.

18. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan agreed that there should be parity in the conditioned working hours of all disciplined services. The Deputy Chairman and Ms Elizabeth QUAT questioned why the Administration could not relax the three pre-requisites for considering the reduction of working hours. The Deputy Chairman was not satisfied that the five-day week pattern was not yet fully implemented for all staff in the disciplined services.

19. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan enquired about the reasons for the difference in incremental points between Police Constable rank of HKPF and Customs Officer ranks of C&ED. The Chairman commented that the differences in pay scales since 1988 were further widened after 30 years. He asked the Administration to consider whether the differences were still suitable nowadays.

20. Mr SHIU Ka-fai respected the opinions of deputations for aligning pay scales among all disciplined services. However, in view of the social incidents in the past few months, he agreed that HKPF had the unique role of maintaining law and order of society, which justified a separate pay scale for the Police. Mr LUK Chung-hung reflected that it was inappropriate to compare the duties among disciplined services by their pay scales.

21. SCS responded that the Review Committee on Disciplined Services Pay and Conditions of Service (commonly known as the Rennie Committee) and SCDS endorsed, in 1988 and 2008 respectively, to have a separate pay scale for HKPF to recognize the uniqueness of the Police Force, in particular their role as the law-enforcement agency of first and last resort . Comments made on the pay scales of the disciplined services would be relayed to SCDS and SDCS for consideration.

Matters related to the Government Flying Service

22. Mr Jeremy TAM expressed concern on the high turnover rate of pilots of the Government Flying Service ("GFS"). Due to a flourishing aviation industry in recent years, pilots working in GFS might opt to work in the private market for better remuneration. He recommended that GFS should raise the entry salary for pilots.

23. Mr Jeremy TAM pointed out that the rank and insignia of the Head of GFS, i.e. Controller, were equivalent to those of the Deputy Director of another disciplined service. As in all disciplined services, rank and insignia were important to boost the morale of the staff, he urged the Administration to align the insignia of the Controller of GFS with that of the Head of Department of other disciplined services. He commented that this could be done immediately as it did not involve any change to the grade structure and salary. Mrs Regina IP commented that the present establishment of GFS was slim and the Controller was not provided with the necessary assistance in administration and management. As such, she suggested creating a position of Deputy Controller in GFS for better manpower and resources management and renaming the Controller of GFS as Director.

24. SCS replied that he would pass members' suggestion to SB. He added that Bureaux/Departments ("B/Ds") could make proposals on creating new positions to cater for operational needs under the established mechanism. Subsequent to the recommendations made by the Director of Audit vide one of his Reports in 2015, a number of new positions had been created in GFS. He believed that the ranking of the Controller of GFS would be considered in the course of the GSR.

Other benefits to disciplined services

25. Mr HO Kai-ming shared his concern over poor coverage of mobile phone signal at some CSD correctional institutions in remote areas. He suggested the Administration provided Wi-Fi service or added transmitting stations at these premises.

26. As duties of disciplined services were mostly physically demanding which might cause musculoskeletal problems, Mr HO Kai-ming suggested the Administration launch a pilot scheme for procurement of medical insurance from the private sector for disciplined services staff. Mr LUK Chung-hung supported Mr HO's suggestion which could also avoid the perception that civil servants were competing for public health resources with the general public.

27. Mr HO Kai-ming also recommended the Administration constructed quarters within the correctional institutions for better utilization of land resources.

28. Ms Elizabeth QUAT urged the Administration to take immediate administrative measures to respond to staff's concern by improving medical benefits, supplying quarters and conducting manpower planning well before any recommendations of the GSR were implemented. Mr LUK Chung-hung enquired if the Administration would implement any short-term measures to boost staff morale.

29. SCS replied that the Administration had been exploring the feasibility of constructing departmental quarters when taking forward redevelopment of disciplined services' facilities. He understood that CSD was considering whether certain areas or rooms in the correctional institutions could be designated for using mobile phones by its staff. If any staff from the disciplined services were injured on duty, under specific circumstances they might opt for medical treatment by private medical practitioners and apply for reimbursement of the medical expenses incurred, subject to the maximum daily rate.

30. SCS further said that the Administration had been proactive in improving medical benefits of civil servants. For instance, two Civil Service Chinese Medicine Clinics would commence service under a pilot scheme in the first quarter of 2020 to provide free Chinese Medicine general consultation and acupuncture services to civil servants. The Administration welcomed any measures raised by individual B/Ds with a view to enhancing staff benefits as long as they would not affect the existing internal relativities among the disciplined services grades. The suggestion about procuring medical insurance from the private sector would have to be carefully considered, as it would involve resource requirement not only for staff of the disciplined services, but for all of the over 180 000 civil servants.

GSR of disciplined services

31. The Deputy Chairman enquired about the roles of CSB and SB in the GSR. He also concurred with some deputations' views on shortening the interval of conducting GSRs to once every five years in view of fast changing employment environment.

32. SCS replied that CSB's role was to provide necessary resources to SCDS and SDCS for the conduct of the review in an independent manner. CSB would also maintain communication with the management and staff representatives of the disciplined services to better understand their requests and opinions in order to consider how the recommendations made by SCDS and SDCS should be taken forward. As for the frequency for conducting GSR, after considering all relevant factors, the Chief Executive-in-Council decided that it was appropriate to conduct a GSR for the disciplined services once every ten years.

33. In view of dissatisfaction of the public towards the Police according to some opinion polls, Mr IP Kin-yuen asked whether SCDS and SDCS would consider public opinion while conducting the GSR. He requested SCDS and SDCS to carry out a public poll on satisfaction towards different disciplined services in order to obtain a comprehensive picture of public opinion.

34. While generally agreeing to the need to consider public opinion, Mr HO Kai-ming pointed out that as the disciplined services were responsible for law-enforcement functions, public opinions might be divisive and highly subjective depending on whether the public activities concerned were subject to law enforcement actions. Mrs Regina IP also expressed the same comment about possible biases in public opinion polls.

35. Mrs Regina IP urged the Administration to consider the deputations' suggestion of adding one Deputy Commissioner position for C&ED. Due to the opening of several new boundary control points in the past few years, a number of junior positions were created for C&ED and the Immigration Department and competition for promotion among staff had become more intense. Mrs IP suggested that the Administration should monitor the overall promotion prospects for staff in both departments.

36. SCS said that SCDS and SDCS had received a large number of submissions from the public expressing views on the GSR. The two

Committees would take public opinions into consideration while conducting the GSR. He would also pass members' opinions to them.

IV. Employment of persons with disabilities in the civil service

(LC Paper No. CB(4)256/19-20(03) -- Administration's paper on employment of persons with disabilities in the civil service

LC Paper No. CB(4)256/19-20(04) -- Paper on employment of persons with disabilities in the civil service prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief)

Other relevant paper

LC Paper No. CB(4)256/19-20(05) -- Submission from a member of the public received on 12 January 2020 requesting the Panel to hold a public hearing on "Employment of persons with disabilities in the civil service" (Chinese version only)

37. At the invitation of the Chairman, SCS briefed members on the employment of persons with disabilities ("PWDs") in the civil service, details of which were set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(4)256/19-20(03)).

(At 12:38 pm, the Chairman decided to extend the meeting for 15 minutes beyond the appointed end-time to allow sufficient time for discussion.)

Employment situation of PWDs in the civil service

38. Noting from the background brief prepared by the Secretariat that the number of PWDs in the civil service had declined by around 15%

from 3319 in 2014-2015 to 2 881 in 2018-2019, and the percentage of civil servants with disabilities in the civil service strength had dropped from 2% to 1.6% in the same period, the Chairman, the Deputy Chairman, Dr Fernando CHEUNG and Dr CHIANG Lai-wan expressed grave concern about the decreasing trend in the total number of PWDs in the civil service. In particular, Dr CHEUNG drew members' attention to the significant decrease of around 30% in the number of civil servants with visual impairment and physical disability in the past 10 years. Worrying that the above situation might set a bad example for private enterprises in employing PWDs, the Deputy Chairman enquired about the reasons for the decrease in the total number of PWDs in the civil service and measures taken by the Administration to address the problem.

39. SCS explained that since there was no requirement for government job applicants and serving civil servants to declare their disabilities, the statistics on civil servants with disabilities were known on the basis of information available to B/Ds, such as through applicants' voluntary declaration, requests made during the recruitment process for special arrangements for selection interview/test having regard to their disabilities, or applications from serving officers with disabilities for financial assistance to purchase technical aids to assist in their performance of duties. Hence, the figures obtained were the lowest figures known to the Administration. He stressed that the number of PWDs in the civil service employed by B/Ds might fluctuate each year, depending on the number of posts available and the recruitment and wastage situation in individual B/Ds, as well as whether the job types of the vacancies were suitable for PWDs. That said, the percentage of civil servants with disabilities remained stable at around 2% of the civil service strength in the past few years.

40. In response to Dr CHIANG Lai-wan's concern that some B/Ds did not employ any PWDs in 2018-2019, SCS said that with a view to exploring whether there was room for enhancement in the recruitment arrangements to facilitate the employment of PWDs, CSB would send representatives to attend selection tests/interviews of those B/Ds with recruitment exercises that attracted a larger number of applicants with disabilities. At his regular meeting with Heads of Departments/Heads of Grades on manpower planning, he would also remind them personally to ensure that PWDs would enjoy equal access to civil service appointment.

41. Regarding the question raised by the Deputy Chairman on whether the Administration had conducted exit surveys to ascertain the reasons for PWDs leaving the civil service, SCS advised that retirement was the primary reason, while other reasons, such as resignation,

completion of agreement and death, only accounted for a small proportion of wastage.

42. Noting that the Administration would categorize applicants who had attained the passing mark in recruitment exercises into three groups of suitability for appointment (i.e. "very suitable", "suitable" and "marginally suitable"), and applicants with disabilities would be placed ahead of other applicants whose suitability for appointment was considered comparable to the former, Mr CHAN Chun-ying enquired about the classification of the 104 PWDs who were offered with appointment from April 2018 to September 2019.

43. SCS explained that as the appointees had already been identified as suitable for appointment, the Administration did not collect statistics as to which suitability group they belonged to. He added that the suitability for appointment of applicants with disabilities for individual recruitment exercises would depend on, among others, whether the job requirements of the vacancies could be commensurate with the abilities of the applicants. For example, PWDs might encounter limitations in performing jobs involving extensive manual and outdoor work; on the other hand, it was worthy to note that for instance, the success rate of applicants with disabilities (38.71%) for the Assistant Clerical Officer rank was higher than that of other applicants (25.83%) from April 2018 to September 2019.

44. Dr Fernando CHEUNG reminded the Administration that as the nature of disabilities and talents of PWDs varied, it should not hold the wrong perception that PWDs were only capable for some designated types of jobs.

Measures to facilitate the employment of PWDs in the civil service

45. Both Dr Fernando CHEUNG and the Chairman cast doubt on the effectiveness of the measures implemented by the Administration in facilitating the employment of PWDs in the civil service. Given that the number of newly recruited civil servants with disabilities represented less than 1% of the total number of new recruits in the civil service from 2016-2017 to 2018-2019, Dr CHEUNG suggested the Administration setting an annual target ratio of PWDs for newly recruited civil servants. Pointing out that the number of PWDs leaving the civil service was greater than the number of new recruits with disabilities in the civil service, the Chairman considered that the Administration should make more efforts in facilitating the employment of PWDs in the civil service

by enhancing the success rate of applicants with disabilities for civil service vacancies.

46. SCS said that appointment to the civil service was based on the principle of open and fair competition. All applicants in an open recruitment exercise were assessed on the basis of their character, ability and performance, having regard to the stipulated entry requirements set according to the job requirements. The Administration had not set upper or lower limit for employing PWDs as civil servants. The policy was to ensure that PWDs, like other applicants, enjoyed equal opportunities in applying for government jobs by putting in place appropriate measures to facilitate their participation in the recruitment process, and give them an appropriate degree of preference for appointment.

47. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan said that to her understanding, many civil servants with disabilities had shown outstanding performance, the Administration should assign them with duties which they were suitable to perform and CSB should encourage B/Ds to provide more opportunities for PWDs.

48. SCS advised that if an applicant with disabilities was found suitable to carry out the duties of certain posts in a specific rank, he/she might be offered appointment even though he/she might not be able to perform the full range of duties of every post in the concerned rank due to his/her disability. Special arrangements would be made to match suitable postings to appointees with disabilities having regard to their different nature and degree of disabilities. For example, persons with hearing impairment who were engaged as Workmen would not be required to work under noisy working environments. The Administration would provide on-the-job assistance and suitable work accommodation for civil servants with disabilities, including modification of work areas and facilities, adjustments to job design and provision of necessary technical aids and office furniture/equipment. Special arrangements would also be made to post appointees with disabilities to an office near their place of residence, where possible.

Internship Scheme for Students with Disabilities

49. The Deputy Chairman asked, among the 300 students who had participated in the annual Internship Scheme for Students with Disabilities ("the Scheme") launched by CSB since 2016, the number of students from the Shine Skills Centre ("Shine") of the Vocational Training Council, and the number of interns from Shine that were successfully employed by B/Ds or in the private sector upon graduation.

50. SCS advised that a total of 119 participants from Shine had joined the Scheme since it was launched in 2016. The number of interns from Shine varied each year. In 2019, 35 students from Shine were arranged to have their internship in 20 B/Ds. The Administration did not have complete information on the employment details of all interns from Shine. However, according to the feedback from the Vocational Training Council, the Scheme enabled students from Shine to gain work experience and strengthen their competitiveness in job seeking after graduation.

51. With a view to evaluating the effectiveness of the Scheme in facilitating the employment of PWDs, Dr Fernando CHEUNG considered that the Administration should keep in view the employment status of the participants of the Scheme. SCS replied that to his understanding, at least three alumni of the Scheme had joined the civil service as Administration Officers/Executive Officers.

(To allow sufficient time for discussion, the Chairman suggested and members agreed to further extend the meeting to 1:15 pm.)

Measures to promote the employment of PWDs

52. Mr CHAN Chun-ying asked whether the Administration had conducted any surveys on the employment situation of PWDs in private sector. To facilitate the employment of PWDs, Mr CHAN considered that the Administration should share relevant experience with private enterprises. Dr Fernando CHEUNG echoed that the Administration could make reference to some overseas countries in implementing employment quota system for PWDs to require employers to employ a certain number or percentage of PWDs, and launched the system within the Government and required statutory bodies and subvention organizations to follow. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan agreed that CSB should formulate measures to promote the employment of PWDs in Government-funded public bodies and other public service organizations.

53. SCS stressed that it was the Government's policy to ensure that PWDs could enjoy equal opportunities as other applicants in applying for government jobs by formulating and implementing measures to facilitate their participation in the recruitment process. The Administration had to give careful consideration to the suggestion of setting a quota as raised by Dr CHEUNG as it might create a labelling effect on PWDs and would not be conducive to their integration to the workplace. As regards the general policy to assist PWDs in securing employment, SCS said that it

was under the purview of the Labour and Welfare Bureau and believed that the Bureau would keep in view the employment situation of PWDs in private sector.

Letter from a member of the public

54. The Chairman drew members' attention to the letter (LC Paper No. CB(4)256/19-20(05)) from a member of the public suggesting that the Panel should hold a public hearing to receive views from the public on the subject. The Chairman invited members' views on the letter.

55. Dr Fernando CHEUNG was supportive of the proposal as he considered that the measures adopted by the Administration to assist PWDs in securing employment were ineffective, and holding a public hearing could provide a platform for the Panel to better understand the difficulties that PWDs had encountered in relating to employment issues in the civil service. Mr CHAN Chun-ying agreed that the Panel should hold a public hearing to receive views from PWDs on the subject.

56. Taking into consideration members' views, the Chairman concluded that a public hearing would be conducted to receive public views on the subject. Members would be duly informed of the arrangements for the public hearing later.

V. Any other business

57. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:15pm.

Panel on Public Service

Meeting on Monday, 20 January 2020, at 10:45 am

Agenda item III - Grade structure review of disciplined services

Summary of views and concerns expressed by deputations

No.	Name of deputation	Submission/Major views and concerns
1.	Hong Kong Customs and Excise Customs Officer Grade Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Presentation of views as set out in the submission LC Paper No. CB(4)846/18-19(02) (Chinese version only)
2.	Hong Kong Customs and Excise Staff General Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Presentation of views as set out in the submissions LC Paper No. CB(4)846/18-19(04) (Chinese version only) and LC Paper No. CB(4)256/19-20(06) (Chinese version only)
3.	Hong Kong Correctional Services Department Assistant Officers General Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Presentation of views as set out in the submission LC Paper No. CB(4)867/18-19(06) (Chinese version only)
4.	Customs Officer Grade Branch of the Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Presentation of views as set out in the submission LC Paper No. CB(4)885/18-19(01) (Chinese version only)